June 1, 2020

Update to the City of Del Mar CEQA Guidelines

Guidelines for Transportation Impact Analysis

Introduction:

The Transportation Impact Analysis guidance is intended to assist City staff, project proponents, the public, and decision makers in determining whether, based on substantial evidence, a project may have a significant effect on the environment under CEQA Section 21082.2 that requires mitigation. This guidance is consistent with 2013 California Senate Bill 743 (SB 743), the Del Mar Community Plan (General Plan), Del Mar Climate Action Plan, and City Council Policy 114 (Complete Streets).

The purpose is to analyze the transportation impact of a proposed project by assessing the associated vehicle miles traveled (VMT) and related noise, air pollution, and greenhouse gas emission impacts. Analysis of the significance of a proposed project transportation-related impact will depend on multiple factors (i.e. project setting, design, construction, timing, etc). Where transportation-related impacts are identified, the intent of the mitigation is to promote public health and quality of life through strategies that reduce VMT and invest in "complete streets" improvements that support non-vehicular access to everyday activities in Del Mar.

This guidance is intended to provide a consistent and objective basis for determining the level of significance of a project's transportation-related impacts. It is to be used in conjunction with commonly accepted professional standards, judgements, and practices.

Step 1: Determine the Project Type

Determine which type of project is proposed.

For the purpose of the CEQA analysis, VMT for a project is to be classified into the following categories and the associated metrics are to be analyzed accordingly as applicable:

- Residential uses – Compare project to Del Mar VMT per resident
- Employment uses – Compare project to Del Mar VMT per employee
- Other land use uses – Compare project to total Regional VMT

The San Diego Association of Governments (SANDAG) provides an online VMT calculation tool to estimate project VMT. SANDAG also has a VMT database where models can be run for each City and the region as a whole. The SANDAG VMT database is what is used to identify the Del Mar VMT and Regional VMT for comparison to the estimated VMT of a proposed project.

Step 2: Determine if the project is eligible to be "screened out" and exempt from further VMT analysis

Determine whether the proposed project has potential to cause a significant effect on the environment. Where applicable, calculate the trip generation for the project. Then determine

whether the project type is eligible to be screened out with no further VMT analysis required. The following project types are presumed to cause a less than significant impact on the environment and are therefore exempt from any further VMT analysis, unless substantial evidence is otherwise identified that indicates a project would generate a potentially significant level of VMT:

- Projects that generate less than 110 trips per day
- Projects of 18 apartments or less
- Projects of 11 single dwelling units or less
- Projects of 2,750 square feet or less of commercial retail
- Projects of local serving retail that are less than 10,000 square feet and that would offer a new retail option in Del Mar that is currently only offered outside of the City
- Projects within .5 miles of a high-quality transit stop with fixed route bus service that has bus intervals no longer than 15 minutes during the weekday commute hours (State PRC 2115)
- Projects with 100 percent affordable units
- Transit, bicycle, and pedestrian projects
- Roadway and mobility projects included in the Del Mar Community Plan
- Amendments to a Land Use Plan or Zoning Ordinance that provide for mixed use zoning that allows up to 20 dwelling units per acre

If the project is not screened out, then proceed to the Step 3 analysis per the CEQA Guidelines.

<u>Step 3: Analyze and Compare the Project to the City's Transportation - CEQA Significance Thresholds:</u>

Answer the following CEQA Guideline questions about the proposed project to help determine whether there will be a potential significant impact as follows:

a. Would the project or plan/policy conflict with an adopted program, plan, ordinance or policy addressing the transportation system including transit, roadways, bicycle, and pedestrian facilities?

b. Would the project or plan/policy result in VMT that is not at least 15 percent below the existing baseline VMT for Del Mar as applicable?

c. Would the project or plan/policy substantially increase hazards due to a design feature or incompatible use?

d. Would the project or plan/policy result in inadequate emergency access?

Step 4: Determine whether the proposed project has the Potential to cause a Significant Impact

As the City of Del Mar residential, employment and total VMT are above the regional average, proposed projects that are not screened out will result in a significant transportation impact. Therefore, the City of Del Mar has established the existing baseline to be the existing City of Del Mar VMT/resident (residential project), VMT/employee (employment projects) and total VMT for all other projects. The existing VMT baseline condition is based on SANDAG's VMT maps using the most recent version of the SANDAG travel demand forecasting model.

View SANDAG's VMT per capita and VMT per employee map here:

- VMT/capita: http://sandag.github.io/sb743/sb743_concept_map.htm
- VMT/employee: http://sandag.github.io/sb743/sb743_concept_map_employee.htm

Mitigation shall be required to reduce project VMT to 15 percent below the existing baseline. The required 15 percent reduction is consistent with the Del Mar Climate Action Plan and with recommendations of the Governor's Office of Planning and Research and California Air Resources Board as necessary to meet the State of California climate action goals.

Step 5: Require mitigation

If a project is not screened out, then the project is required to provide VMT mitigation that would result in a reduction in project VMT to a level considered below the Threshold of Significance. As stated in Step 4, this is 15% below the baseline condition. If the project is not able to provide the 15% VMT reduction, as outlined in Step 4, the environmental document shall disclose an unmitigated significant transportation impact associated with the proposed project.

The following mitigation options should be made available to address mobility and reduced congestion, VMT, greenhouse gas emissions (GHG) and air pollution:

- Implementation of Local Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Strategies
- Mitigation through Payment of an In-Lieu Fee

Mitigation through the Implementation of Transportation Demand Management

Transportation Demand Management (TDM) is a mitigation tool that is used to improve mobility and reduce congestion, VMT, GHG emissions, and air pollution. For a project that requires mitigation, an applicant may select one or more measures from the City's TDM Matrix or equivalent mitigation measures consistent with City Council Policy 114 (Complete Streets) as necessary to reduce the project VMT by at least 15%.

Mitigation through the Payment of In-Lieu Fee

As an alternative to implementing TDM improvements or programs in accordance with the mitigation option above, a project applicant may pay an in-lieu fee in accordance with the methodology approved by the City Council into the City's in-lieu fee mitigation fund. Once established, the in-lieu mitigation fund shall be used by the City to contribute to or fund active transportation projects and programs. This can include decisions by the Del Mar City Council to approve the contribution of in-lieu program funds towards:

- Local mobility programs to be determined such as:
  - Bike share or Electric Vehicle share program
  - On-demand transportation service (community assistance programs, first/last mile transit)
  - Shuttle (electric vehicle)
  - Wayfinding signage to connect users to locations of sustainable transportation choices
- Mobility partnership agreements with major employers located in Del Mar or that employ a significant number of local residents (i.e. 22nd District Agricultural Association and UCSD)
- Mobility projects in SANDAG's regional TDM program (i.e. removal of the railroad from the bluff)

Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Strategies Matrix

Method	Description	CAPCOA	SANDAG	Level of Effort	Potential Cost
PG1. Comprehensive Employer Commute Program and/or Involvement in Free Commute Trip Reduction Program (iCommute)	Helps local businesses, helping them develop and implement customized employee commuter benefit programs. May include some or all the following: • Marketing, outreach, and education of alternative travel to employees • Bi-annual surveying of employee commutes • Personal trip planning • Commuter assistance • Guaranteed Ride Home • Regional recognition program	Voluntary involvement 6.2% Required involvement and monitoring 21%	Up to 26% (SANDAG)	Low	Free
PG2. Commute Information for New Hires	A flyer or communication to new hires that highlight local alternative travel options. May include: • Nearby or regional bike routes or facilities • Local or regional transit connections • Guaranteed Ride Home information • Carpool/vanpool information/resources	Minimal in isolation (CAPCOA), best grouped with PG1	Minimal in isolation (SANDAG), best grouped with PG1	Low	$
PG3. Telecommuting and/or Alternative Work Schedules	Remote work at least one day per week or implement a condensed workweek schedule	Up to 21% (CAPCOA)	Up to 44% (SANDAG)	Med	$
Alternative Travel Employer Subsidies	Subsidies or partial subsidies provided for various alternative travel: • Bike commuting • Carpooling • Vanpooling • Transit	5.5% (CAPCOA)	Up to 11% (SANDAG)	Med	$$$
Priced Workplace Parking	Employers or property managers charge single occupancy vehicle commuters a daily rate	Up to 2% (CAPCOA)	-	High	$$$
Onsite Bike Share	Employer provides a bike share program for staff to use to minimize VMT during workhours	Minimal in isolation. Works best when implemented with PG1	--	High	$

Method	Description	CAPCOA	SANDAG	Level of Effort	Potential Cost
Subsidize Costs Associated with Alternative Travel	Provide partial or full reimbursement for: • Costs associated with biking to work (lights, reflectors, panniers, tune-ups, etc) • Costs associated with carpooling to work (car wash, oil changes, headphones) • Costs associated with walking to work (new shoes, reflective gear, headphones)	--	--	Med	$$$
Provide end-of-trip facilities	Provide lockers, bike parking, and showers; can be established based on the number of parking spaces or parking space reduction.	Minimal in isolation. Works best when implemented with PG1	Minimal in isolation (SANDAG)	Med	$$
Commute Trip Reduction Marketing	Marketing materials that highlight alternative commuting on an ongoing basis or participation in Rideshare Week and/or Bike to Work Day. Marketing materials can be provided by SANDAG. Businesses and/or employers can promote campaigns to staff and city residents.	Up to 4% (CAPCOA)	Works best when implemented will full commute trip reduction program (see PG1)	Low	$

Cost for Implementation

$ Low Cost (less than $10,000)

$$ Medium Cost ($10,000 to $50,000, may include annual recurring cost)

$$$ High Cost (more than $50,000, may include annual recurring cost)

Method	Description	CAPCOA	SANDAG	Level of Effort	Potential Cost
S1. Increase TODs (with affordable or BMR housing)		See S2, PJ2, and PJ6	Up to 14%	High	$$$
S2. Integrate Affordable and Below Market Housing	BMR housing provides greater opportunity for lower income families to live closer to jobs centers and achieve jobs/housing match near transit	1.2% (CAPCOA)	Varies widely. Works best when implemented with S1 and other TDM strategies	High	$$$
S3. Increase Land Density	Percentage increase in housing units per acre, number of jobs per job acre,	Up to 30% (CAPCOA)	--	High	$$$
S4. Increase Transit Accessibility	Transit connections to regional destinations and neighborhoods designed for walking and cycling to transit	Up to 25% (CAPCOA)	--	Low	$$
S4. Zone for and/or Support Mixed Use Development	Co-locate land uses; strategically place development close to transit, jobs, and/or bike facilities (lanes, trails, etc.)	Up to 30% (CAPCOA)	Varies widely. Works best when implemented with a variety of TDM strategies	Med	$
S5. Enhancements to Pedestrian and/or Bike Network	Enhancement of sidewalks, bike lanes, bike parking, wayfinding, or payment to city for improvements	1% per square mile of Class II bike lanes (CAPCOA)	up to 1.4 for pedestrian improvements and 0.3% for bike improvements (SANDAG)	Med	$$$

Method	Description	CAPCOA	SANDAG	Level of Effort	Potential Cost
S6. Traffic Calming Measures	• Bulb outs • High visibility (continental) crosswalks • Lane width reductions • Reverse-angled parking in dense areas or near beach • Traffic circles and/or roundabouts • Chicanes • Raised crosswalks at highly trafficked intersections • Medians and islands	2% (CAPCOA)	--	Medium	$$-$$$
S7. Microtransit to/from COASTER Station	A public-private partnership to implement first/last mile options to/from the COASTER station. May include: • NEV community shuttle • Van shuttle • E-bike share	--	Varies widely	Medium	$$
S8. Reduce Parking Requirements on Development Applications	Establish parking maximums or provide incentives for employment uses to reduce employee parking through implementation of complimentary TDM programs (vanpool, carpool, etc).	--	Varies widely based on parking minimum	Low	$
S9. Implement a Citywide Bikeshare Program	Could expand upon North County Coastal communities bike share program	Best implemented grouped with S10 and PJ3	Up to 0.1% (SANDAG)	High	$
S10. Expand Pedestrian and Bike facilities and/or designate land for pedestrian or bike trails	Connection to regional trail systems.	Best implemented grouped with PJ3	Up to 5% (SANDAG)	High	$$-$$$
S11. Implement a Rideshare Program with a Rideshare, Carpool, or Vanpool Vendor	Assistance can be provided by SANDAG or vanpool vendor in establishing citywide program	--	Up to 8% (SANDAG)	Medium	$$

Method	Description	CAPCOA	SANDAG	Level of Effort	Potential Cost
S12. Citywide Commute Reduction Marketing	Marketing material for city residents	5.5% work VMT	--	Low	$
S13. Mobility Hub Improvements	Designate a mobility hub and apply for grants to enhance, with the support of SANDAG staff and/or make mobility hub improvements to existing transit	--	Up to 5.9% (SANDAG)	High	$$$
S14. School Pool Program	A program and/or app that allows parents to connect to one another and promote alternative travel to/from school	Up to 15.8% (CAPCOA)	--	Medium	$-$$
S16. Community Bike Education	Provide bike education for all ages at public events	--	--	Low	$-$$
S17. Implement A Transportation Management Association (TMA) or Transportation Management Organization (TMO)	Non-profit, member-controlled organizations that provide transportation services in a given area. Allows businesses to pool money and provide commuter support	TMA's are cited in CAPCOA, but are not highlighted as a specific *method*. May result in similar VMT reduction as noted in PG1.	--	High	$$$
S18. Citywide Carshare Program	Partner with a vendor to provide a carshare program to reduce parking demand and VMT in high-demand areas such as the coast and/or shopping centers	--	0.7% (SANDAG)	Medium	$$

Cost for Implementation

$ Low Cost (less than $10,000)

$$ Medium Cost ($10,000 to $50,000, may include annual recurring cost)

$$$ High Cost (more than $50,000, may include annual recurring cost)

Method	Description	CAPCOA	SANDAG	Level of Effort	Potential Cost
PJ 1. Parking management	• Flexible curb space (varies) • Shared parking (varies) • Smart parking (varies) • Reduced parking (5-12%, CAPCOA) • Parking Cash-out (up to 12%, SANDAG) • Unsubsidized (or priced) parking (2.6-12.8% CAPCOA; 12%, SANDAG) • Preferential parking for carpool and vanpool (varies) • Unbundle parking cost from property cost (varies)	Up to 20% (CAPCOA)	Varies widely based on what type of parking management is implement (SANDAG)	Low	$$$
PJ 2. Increase Transit Accessibility (project)	Provide access and connections to local and regional facilities such bicycle lanes, trails and transit stops.	Up to 25% (CAPCOA)	--	Low	$$
PJ 3. Enhancements or Expansions to Pedestrian and/or Bike Network (project)	Installation of sidewalks, bike lanes, bike parking, wayfinding, or payment to city for improvements	1% per square mile of Class II bike lanes (CAPCOA)	up to 1.4 for pedestrian improvements and 0.3% for bike improvements (SANDAG)	High	$$-$$$
PJ 4. Bikeshare Program	Program available for tenants, residents, or guests of development	0.01% (CAPCOA)	Up to 0.1% (SANDAG)	Medium	$$
PJ 5. Transit Fare Subsidy	Provide transit passes for tenants or residents for up to a year	20% work VMT; no data for housing developments (CAPCOA)	--	Low	$$$

Method	Description	CAPCOA	SANDAG	Level of Effort	Potential Cost
PJ 6. Improve project or development design	Pedestrian-forward design • Shade • Sidewalks in parking lots • Garden area and seating • Benches and/or street furniture on sidewalk adjacent to property Design with commuters in-mind (or end-of-trip facilities) • showers • secure, covered bike storage • lockers • café or dining area on site • orientation to sidewalk, bike path, or transit facility	Up to 21.3% (CAPCOA)	Best used with other TDM strategies listed in section	High	$$$
PJ 7. Impact fees	If developer or employer is not willing or able to implement X% of final City TDM measures, they pay a fee which goes to help City fund multi-modal travel enhancements or projects	--	--	High	$$-$$$

Cost for Implementation

$ Low Cost (less than $10,000)

$$ Medium Cost ($10,000 to $50,000, may include annual recurring cost)

$$$ High Cost (more than $50,000, may include annual recurring cost)